

The 3<sup>rd</sup> IABU (The International Association of Buddhist Universities) Conference  
“Mindfulness: its traditions and compassionate application”  
on 6th - 8th May 2017  
at Mahachulalongkornrajavidyalaya University (MCU),  
Ayutthaya, Thailand

# Lovingkindness Meditation in Sarvāstivāda and Early Mahāyāna Tradition<sup>1</sup>

by Fa Qing

Through all Buddhist traditions, we can find a common ground in the theory of praxis: no-self (*anātman*) and lovingkindness (*maitrī*). In Chinese Buddhism, we use the term *cibei* (慈悲), lovingkindness and compassion (*maitrī-karuna*). In daily practice or at the conventional level (*samṃṛti satya*), we practice lovingkindness and compassion. In the higher level (*paramārtha satya*), we observe no-self (*anātman*) or emptiness (*śūnyatā*). In other words, no-self or emptiness is the wisdom functioning as the guideline for practice; lovingkindness and compassion are the application in daily life when we encounter others. Practicing lovingkindness and compassion without a sense of self is the core of Mahāyāna Buddhism.

In the following, I will try to explore the practice of lovingkindness meditation (*maitrī*) found in the meditation manuals of the northern tradition (Sarvāstivāda and Early Mahāyāna in India).

## 1. Introduction

In the development of Buddhist thought in China, texts on meditation were the first to be translated into Chinese. The very first text was the translation of *the Ānāpāna Mindfulness Sūtra* (T602 *Anpan shou yi jing*) by An Shigao at Loyang around 147 to 171 C.E., which classifies the contemplation of the impure (*aśubha*) as a more advanced “inner” practice compared with mindfulness of breathing (*ānāpānasmṛti*).<sup>2</sup>

Thereafter, there was an uninterrupted arrival of Buddhist monks from India and Central Asia. When Kumārajīva arrived at Chang-an in 401 C.E., Chinese monks immediately came to him for instruction on meditation practice.<sup>3</sup> Under the request of the Chinese, Kumārajīva had compiled and translated important meditation texts:

---

<sup>1</sup> The first version of this paper was presented at the International Theravāda Buddhist Missionary University, Yangon, Myanmar, on 20th to 21st, December, 2016.

<sup>2</sup> T602, 165b1-2.

<sup>3</sup> T2145, 65a: Seng-rui in his “關中出禪經” claims that Seng-rui had received meditation teaching from Kumārajīva after one week he came to Chang-an, on the 26<sup>th</sup> of December, 401 CE.

- *The Dhyānasamādhi-sūtra* (T514), a combination of different meditation teachings at that time in the northern part of India and Central Asia.
- *Outline of Way to Reflect* (T617), which is an informative book on Sarvāstivāda and Early Mahāyāna Meditation. The text uses popular ideas of the time (*Amitāyus*, Lotus Sūtra, *Prajñāptivāda*, medical information, meditation manuals from the Gandhāran cultural area, i.e. non-Kāsmīra *Jibin* 罽賓).<sup>4</sup>

In addition, some Chinese monks also went as pilgrims to India. Faxian and Zhiyan were among the first pilgrim monks who went to India. Zhiyan (305-427) practiced meditation under the renowned Sarvāstivāda meditation teacher Buddhasena.<sup>5</sup> Zhiyan also invited Buddhasena's disciple, Buddhahadra (359-429) to China to teach meditation. Buddhahadra brought his teacher's meditation manual,<sup>6</sup> the *\*Dharmatrāta-dhyāna-sūtra* (T618) to China and translated it into Chinese (cir. 411). That was the first time that the *dhyāna* practice of a distinctive lineage, i.e., the Sarvāstivāda School, was formally taught in China.

In the preface of the *\*Dharmatrāta-dhyāna-sūtra*, it claims that the original book in Sanskrit is *Yogācārabhūmi* (T618, p301b22: 庾伽遮羅浮迷),<sup>7</sup> which could be traced back to Saṃgharakṣa. His book, the *Yogācārabhūmi Sūtra*, had been translated into Chinese several times.<sup>8</sup> In 403, Kumārajīva compiled the *Dhyānasamādhi-sūtra* which also included some part of the Saṃgharakṣa's meditation methods.

In Sarvāstivāda, there are three groups of masters:<sup>9</sup>

1. Ābhīdharmikas, based on reasoning, stress on teaching.
2. Dārṣṭāntikas, the forerunner of Sautrāntika, specialize in sūtras (*sūtradhara*). Dharmatrāta and Buddhadeva are the most eminent.
3. Yogācāras, derived from Dārṣṭāntikas, emphasize the importance of personal meditation experience. Saṃgharakṣa and Aśvagoṣa are the well-known meditation masters.

<sup>4</sup> Charles Willemsen, *Outlining the Way to Reflect Outline*, 16-17.

<sup>5</sup> According to Faxian (高僧法顯傳 T2085, 857a), who met Zhiyan (智嚴) in 400 CE, Zhiyan had studied meditation from Buddhasena for three years.

<sup>6</sup> The *Dhyāna sūtra* is the direct teaching from Buddhasena, not Dharmatrāta. The 17 sections of the sūtra are the 17 meditation divisions made by Buddhasena. Yinshun, *Study on Sarvāstivādin Abhidharma and Ābhīdharmikas* (Taiwan: Zhengwen Publisher, 1992): p. 624.

<sup>7</sup> The *Yogācārabhūmi* was named the *Dharmatrāta-dhyāna-sūtra* in China may have connection with the Chan Buddhism. The first patriarch of Chinese Chan Buddhism referred initially to Dharmatrāta in the early years of the development of the Chinese Chan School. It was only in the later development that the identity of the first patriarch was ascribed to be Bodhidharma. Such a change of identity carries grave implications on the doctrinal development of Chinese Chan Buddhism. Lu Cheng, *Outline of Chinese Buddhism* (Beijing: Zhonghua Book company, 1979): pp. 369.

<sup>8</sup> The early and completed version was translated by Dharmarakṣa's in 284 CE, with 8 fascicle. Other partial translations: Around 160 CE, Ah Shi Gao translated an abridged version with one fascicle (道地經), and Zhiyao 支曜 translated another one with one fascicle (小道地經).

<sup>9</sup> Yinshun, *Study on Sarvāstivādin Abhidharma*, p. 615.

While many Ābhidharmikas came from meditation group, in fact there was strong meditation practice around the Gandhāra and Kaśmīra areas. Sarvāstivādin Yogācāras integrated their body and mind experiences into the teaching of Abhidharma.<sup>10</sup> The *Dharmatrāta-dhyāna-sūtra* was derived from this Yogācāras lineage.

Meditation methods, such as the two main methods (*ānāpāna* and *aśubha*), the four stages (四分)<sup>11</sup>, are common to all Sarvāstivāda and other Buddhist Schools. But the dividing the four stages further into two paths - the preparatory path (*prayoga-mārga* 方便道) and the advanced path (*viśeṣa mārga* 勝道) - is unique, not shared by early suttas/sūtras. The two path theory was developed by those Yogācārins in the Gandhari area (*Jibin*).<sup>12</sup>

After the arrival of Buddhahadra in Chang-an (cir. 409), Buddhahadra challenged Kumārajīva's influence on the contemporary Chinese Buddhist community. Since Kumārajīva's meditation texts (composed and translated by him) are not from his own experiences. Buddhahadra won the sympathy of some Chinese Buddhists through his perseverance and austere monastic practice, especially his qualification as an effective meditation teacher. However, due to Kumārajīva's fame, Buddhahadra eventually was expelled out of Chang-an, but warmly received by the Chinese Buddhist community in the South.

In the Sarvāstivāda tradition, lovingkindness meditation is described as an antidote to hatred as one of the five meditation methods:

1. mindfulness on impurity (*aśubha*)-- antidote to sensual craving
2. mindfulness on lovingkindness (*maitrī*) – antidote to hatred
3. mindfulness on causation (*pratītyasamutpāda*) – antidote to ignorance
4. mindfulness on breathing (*ānāpāna*)<sup>13</sup> – antidote to discursive thought
5. mindfulness on elements (*dhātu*).

---

<sup>10</sup> Ibid.

<sup>11</sup> The four stages:

1. retrogression (*hāṇa-bhāgīya*, 退分) – when one can still fall from attainments,
2. staying (*sthiti-bhāgīya*, 住分) – although not retrogressing, there is also no progress,
3. further progress (*parākramaṇa-bhāgīya*, 昇進分),
4. penetration (nirvedha-bhāgīya, 決定分) – the stage where the four skillful roots are acquired, then the practitioner is capable of —entering into the Certitude of Perfection. (*samyaktva-niyāma /nyāma*) – *avakrānti* 入正性決定, 入正性離生), i.e., entering the path of vision (*darśana-mārga*).

<sup>12</sup> Yinshun, *Study on Sarvāstivādin Abhidharma*, pp. 630-631.

<sup>13</sup> In Chinese, *ānāpānasmṛti* often translated as 數息(counting the breath). The correct translation should be 入出息念 (in-out breathing). Counting is the first step of practicing *ānāpānasmṛti* in the Sarvāstivāda meditation texts.

Later in Kumārajīva's meditation sūtra, concentration (*samādhi*) on the mindfulness of the Buddhas (*buddhānusmṛti*) is replaced with *dhātu* as antidote to the combination of the above defilements (等分)<sup>14</sup>

## 2. lovingkindness in the *Dharmatrāta-dhyāna-sūtra*

*The Dharmatrāta-dhyāna-sūtra* mainly teaches *aśubha* and *ānāpānasmṛti* and offers more detailed practical methods compared with other Sarvāstivāda meditation texts. The text is divided into 17 sections. Section 14 deals with the *Samādhi* of the Four Immeasurables.<sup>15</sup>

The sūtra begins by explaining the general practice of lovingkindness, which is the same as those in the Early Buddhism. One practices lovingkindness starting with love ones, neutral ones and enemies, and then radiate towards all sentient beings with the even-mind.

Practice lovingkindness meditation to all sentient beings with the even-mind, to extinguish one's anger, then to raise the lovingkindness mind. This is called the general practice of lovingkindness *samādhi*.<sup>16</sup>

What is unique about the sūtra is that it explains further practices of the three kinds of lovingkindness:

1. The broad and great lovingkindness (廣大慈): one can attain *nibbāna/nirvāṇa*.

After extinguishing hatred and dwelling in lovingkindness mind, we share the Buddha's teachings with all sentient beings. In accordance with sentient beings' virtues and wholesome roots, we guide them in the practice of lovingkindness, share with them experiencing all kinds of dharma-happiness: the happiness of the *samādhi* of meditation, the happiness of holy life (*śramaṇa*), the happiness of enlightenment, and the happiness of cessation.

The practitioner, both the giver and receiver, could attain pure and wholesome roots, and even attain the unsurpassed *nirvāṇa* and the utmost unconditioned dharmas (*asaṃskṛta dharma*).

As one's practice advances, various joys and signs will appear after their thought. Once the thought arises, one should observe one by one with concrete signs as evidence, one will surely enter penetration. Like a clear mirror which reflects truly the images of

---

<sup>14</sup> 等分, not so sure the original Sanskrit text. Paul Demiéville uses *saṃnipāta* (combination) for 等分. See his "La Yogācārabhūmi de Sangharaksa." p. 356. In *the Five Gates Dhyāna Essential Methods* (五門禪經要用法), it uses "心沒者"(those whose thoughts disappear; heedless) T15, No.619, 325c.

<sup>15</sup> T618, p.319c-p.320b.

<sup>16</sup> T618, p. 319, c11-13: 先等心思惟，總緣一切眾生，令心堅固，滅除瞋恚而起慈心，是名總觀慈無量三昧。

things, the mirror of lovingkindness *samādhi*, being driven by joy, reveals various joyful signs right before the practitioner.<sup>17</sup>

2. The extremely far-reaching lovingkindness (極遠慈): to prevent hatred

Sometimes, when the practitioner is confused by hatred, one should reflect: “From the beginning up to now, due to hatred, I have committed multiple killings; have done numerous wrongdoings; have entered the evil path and experienced bitter sufferings in the hells; and have been reborn as wasps and scorpions, centipedes, poisonous snakes, wicked dragons, harmful ghosts, demons (*rākṣasa*) and all sorts of poisonous and harmful beings like these. Now, if the hatred is not eradicated, the troublesome will arise again.” With this skillful means, the practitioner can get rid of hatred.<sup>18</sup>

3. The immeasurable lovingkindness (無量慈): to avoid conflicts, one can attain Arhant or become Buddha.

In addition, the practitioner should contemplate: “the swearer and the one being sworn at are both impermanent in the sense that the incident does not last more than a moment. Both parties will surely pass. When the swear-words are extinct, the two persons involved will have no reason for debate. Moreover, the thoughts of these two persons involved are fleeting all the time which are inherently unreal and baseless. The one who swears and the one being sworn at are both erroneous, like fighting with empty space. Besides, the practitioner knows full well that the organ of hearing is arisen from the unreal and baseless source of defilement and the same is true for the organ of taste of the swearer. Hence things are casually produced and extinguished, who swears and who listens?” When the practitioner reasons in this manner, he will be free from the bonds of anger and can truly be able to cultivate lovingkindness mind, thus will live in a pure and clean state without delusion.

As being taught by the Buddha, “those who practise lovingkindness can enter penetration in their meditation on the four foundations of mindfulness (*smṛtyupasthāna*). In addition, they can surely widen their scope of practice, acquiring

---

<sup>17</sup> T618, p. 319, c17-26: 捨除瞋礙，住仁愛心，隨其所應功德善根，一切佛法皆悉與之，謂與種種法樂，修種種慈，先與出家樂，次與禪定正受樂，次與菩提樂，次與寂滅樂。彼修行者本曾所更及所未更，種種樂具，自得、他得，清淨善根，乃至無上寂滅，究竟無為，隨其修行{者}，意所想念，無量法樂等，與眾生相現在前。樂想起已，一一觀察，以相自證，便得決定。猶如明鏡，因物像現；慈三昧鏡，亦因樂事，種種樂相，悉現在前。

<sup>18</sup> T618, p. 319, c26-p. 320, a2: 或時修行{者}為瞋恚所亂，作是思惟：“我從本來，由是瞋恚，多所殺害，興諸罪逆，入於惡道，於大地獄，還受苦毒；或作蜂蠆、蜈蚣、毒蛇、惡龍、害鬼、羅刹，如是種種毒害之類，今不除滅，復見燒{燒}迫。”以是方便，能止瞋恚。

the immeasurable doctrinal perspective (*dharampariyāya*) and the utmost attainment, from which they will never withdraw.<sup>19</sup>

If one practices lovingkindness without desire, one can fulfill all virtues, and reach the highest attainment, *nirvāṇa*.

Having been freed from desires, the practitioner further cultivates the pure, wondrous, passionless and lovingkindness mind; helps others with firm attention; widens one's practice to the limitless state; one can obtain the real fruit of [arhant]. Therefore, one's virtues are accomplished and one's wish is fulfilled with the utmost *nirvāṇa*. Why? All Buddhas advocate lovingkindness as fearless. lovingkindness is the mother of all virtues. lovingkindness sparks off all virtues. lovingkindness can eradicate all sorts of violence and evil. That is why practitioners should diligently cultivate great lovingkindness without desire.<sup>20</sup>

For the compassion (*karuṇā*), if we are not compassionate to the suffering of others, we are the evil ones. Compassion is the base of the Buddha's teaching. The text explains,

If one is not compassionate towards living beings in unlimited sufferings, one is, indeed, extremely evil and lacks any wholesome roots. Such great compassion is the base of the teachings of all Buddhas. Starting from this very base, one is able to reach exhaustively all the oceans of wisdom. Should one practise compassion fully, not before long, one shall be there.<sup>21</sup>

With regard to the other two immeasurables: empathetic joy (*muditā*), and equanimity (*upekṣā*), the text just briefly defines the practice without giving detailed explanation as it does with lovingkindness.

To compare with Early Buddhism (Pāli suttas and Chinese Āgamas):

1. it uses the term Four Immeasurable *Samādhi* (四無量三昧 *catvāry-apramāṇāni samādhi*), rather than Four Immeasurables.
2. one can attain *nirvāṇa* by practicing lovingkindness.
3. lovingkindness is the mother of all virtues.

---

<sup>19</sup> T618, p. 320, a2-10: 又復思惟: 「罵者、受者, 彼我無常, 須臾不住, 二俱過去。惡聲已滅, 後起二人無故共諍。又今二人念念即滅, 虛妄無實, 誰罵誰受? 何為顛倒與空共鬪? 計我耳根, 從虛妄顛倒煩惱業起, 彼人舌根, 亦復如是, 因緣生滅, 誰罵誰聞? 」修行[者]如是思惟時, 瞋恚縛解, 能修慈心, 離垢清淨。如佛說: 「修慈者於四念處能得決定, 修習增廣, 成就無量法門, 勝妙道果, 不復退還。」 English translation modified from Chan's translation. See, Yiu-wing Chan. *An English Translation of the Dharmatrāra-Dhyāna-Sūtra—With Annotation and a Critical Introduction*. Dissertation (Hong Kong: The University of Hong Kong, 2013): 437-438.

<sup>20</sup> T618, p. 320, a10-15: 若已離欲, 更修淨妙離欲慈心, 深心饒益, 增廣無量, 得真實果。因此功德具足, 所願究竟涅槃。所以者何? 一切諸佛說慈為無畏, 慈為一切功德之母, 慈為一切功德鑽燧, 慈能消滅凶暴諸惡, 是故修[\*]行當勤方便, 修離欲大慈。

<sup>21</sup> T618, p. 320, b1-4: 若見此眾生受無量苦而不起悲, 是則極惡無善根人。如是大悲, 一切諸佛, 本所修習, 由是究竟一切智海; 行者若能具足修習, 當知不久, 必到是處。

4. compassion (*karuṇā*) is the base of the Buddha's teaching.

### 3. lovingkindness in Early Mahāyāna Meditation texts

We will look at Kumārajīva's two meditation texts for the Early Mahāyāna: *The Dhyānasamādhi-sūtra* (T514) and *Outline of Way to Reflect* (T617).

*The Dhyānasamādhi-sūtra* begins with lovingkindness meditation as an antidote to hatred. It divides the practices into 3 levels: the beginners, those who are practicing, those who have practiced for long time. After one's lovingkindness reaches out to beings of all directions, one can attain the *samādhi* of lovingkindness. (T514, p.272b)

The later part of the text has a section dedicated to the Bodhisattva's *samādhi* of lovingkindness. The basic practice methods are the same as explained in early suttas. What is unique for Bodhisattvas' *samādhi* is that one needs to make vows to save all sentient beings after meditation.

Once focused, one shall make this vow, "With the truly pure Dharma of *nirvāṇa*, I shall save sentient beings so that they attain true bliss." Those who practice *samādhi* of lovingkindness with such thoughts, are on the Bodhisattva path. Those who abide in *samādhi* of lovingkindness, they contemplate the true marks of all elements (*dharma*) as pure, indestructible and immovable, wish sentient beings to acquire the benefits of this Dharma. With this *samādhi*, they [extend] lovingkindness thought to all beings in the east so that they attain the bliss of Buddhas. Practitioners do the same for beings throughout the ten directions without altering or distracting their mind. This is called the gate to the *samādhi* of Bodhisattvas' lovingkindness.<sup>22</sup>

It also explains how to enhance the *samādhi* of lovingkindness without retrogressing (不退 *avinivartanīya*). The text has some beautiful verses to explain the so called "aids to lovingkindness" (益慈).<sup>23</sup>

Study the precepts, so that purity and faith delight in you.  
Study the various meditation [to cause] one-minded wisdom.  
Enjoy being in quiet places and never be lax.  
Be content with few desires and follow the lovingkindness teaching.  
Restrain the body, eat little and reduce harmful sleep.  
Do not abandon contemplation in the first part or the latter parts of the night.  
Reduce petty words and keep quiet.  
Be aware of the present moment while sitting, walking, standing and reclining.

<sup>22</sup> T614, p. 282, a5-11: 若得一心，當發願言：「我以涅槃實清淨法，度脫眾生，使得實樂。」行慈三昧，心如  
此者，是菩薩道。住慈三昧，以觀諸法實相清淨，不壞不動，願令眾生，得此法利。以此三昧，慈念東方  
一切眾生，使得佛樂，十方亦爾，心不轉亂，是謂菩薩慈三昧門。

<sup>23</sup> T614, p. 282, b4-10: 問曰：「若當行人得慈三昧，云何不失而復增益？」答曰：「學戒清淨，善信倚{猗}  
樂，學諸禪定，一心智慧，樂處閑靜，常不放逸，少欲知足，行順慈教，節身少食，減損睡眠，初夜後夜，  
思惟不廢，省煩言語，默然守靜，坐臥行住，知時消息，不令失度，致疲苦極，調和寒溫，不令惱亂，是  
謂益慈。」

Do not act without moderation [to avoid] fatigue and suffering.  
Adjust heat and cold not to become bothersome.

*Outline the Way to Reflect* is considered as the Early Mahāyāna meditation book. It stresses that the Four Immeasurables are essential for the Buddha's path.

Those who seek for the Buddha's path should first practise the four immeasurable thoughts. When thoughts are immeasurable, their virtues are also immeasurable.<sup>24</sup> ...When practising lovingkindness thought, one is constantly mindful of sentient beings and allows them to obtain Buddha's happiness. Practising without break, one then attain the first trance (*dhyāna/jhāna*), free from the five desires and five hindrances. For him who has attained the characteristics of the first trance, his entire body knows joy and happiness. Arising joy and happiness among wholesome dharmas and seeing various wondrous forms. This is the *samādhi*, the cause and conditions for entrance to the first gate of the Buddha's path.<sup>25</sup>

There are three levels of attainment when practicing the Four Immeasurables.<sup>26</sup>

1. “patient acceptance of beings”: patient to all beings and without hatred.
2. “patient acceptance of factors”: no factor (*dharmas*) arises or is extinguished, finally characterized by voidness (*śūnyatā*).
3. “patient acceptance of non-production”: one becomes the Buddha.

The three levels of patient acceptance are explained as three stages of lovingkindness *samādhi* in the *Dhyānasamādhi-sūtra*:<sup>27</sup>

1. lovingkindness affinities with sentient beings (眾生緣), refers to practitioners with cankers (*āśava*)
2. lovingkindness affinities with dharmas (法緣), refers to Arhants, Buddhas
3. lovingkindness without affinities (無緣), refers to Buddhas.

The highest level of practice of lovingkindness is attain “the patient acceptance of non-production”, the Buddha.

---

<sup>24</sup> T617, p. 298, a16-17: 求佛道者，當先行四無量心。其心無量，功德亦無量。

<sup>25</sup> T617, p. 298, b9-13: 修習慈心，常念眾生令得佛樂，習之不息，便得離五欲、除五蓋、入初禪。得初禪相者喜樂遍身，諸善法中生歡喜樂，見有種種微妙之色，是名入佛道初門禪定福德因緣也。 Also, 五門禪經要用法T619, 332a-b.

<sup>26</sup> T617, p. 298, a15-b17: 得是四無量心已，於一切眾生忍辱不瞋，是名眾生忍。得眾生忍已，易得法忍。法忍者，所謂諸法不生不滅畢竟空相。能信受是法忍，是名無生忍，得阿耨多羅三藐三菩提記，當得作佛。行者應當如是修習也。

<sup>27</sup> T614, p. 282, c7-10: 是慈三昧略說有三種緣：生緣、法緣、無緣。諸未得道，是名生緣。阿羅漢辟支佛，是名法緣。諸佛世尊，是名無緣，是{故}略說慈三昧門。 The *Prajñāpāramitopadeśa* explains in detail. T15cc 209a-b.

## 4. Comparison with Pāli Nikāya

The Kulaṃ sutta (SN42.9) used a phrase “liberation of mind by lovingkindness” to indicate lovingkindness meditation that can lead people to liberation.

...Just as a strong conch blower can easily send his signal to the four quarters, so too, when the liberation of mind by lovingkindness is developed and cultivated in this way, any limited *kamma* (*pamāṇakataṃ kammaṃ*) that was done does not remain there, does not persist there.<sup>28</sup>

Bhikkhu Bodhi notes (SN42.9 ft346), when “lovingkindness” is said, this can be interpreted as access *samādhi*, but when it is qualified as “liberation of mind” (*cetovimutti*) it definitely means *samādhi*. This may explain why the Sarvāstivādins advocate the *samādhi* of lovingkindness that can lead one to *nibbāna*.

In the Mettāsahagata sutta (SN46:54), the Buddha made differences between his teaching on the Four Immeasurables and other ascetics’ teaching:

And how, bhikkhus, is the liberation of the mind by lovingkindness developed? What does it have as its destination, its culmination, its fruit, its final goal? Here, bhikkhus, a bhikkhu develops the enlightenment factor of mindfulness accompanied by lovingkindness ... the enlightenment factor of equanimity accompanied by lovingkindness, based upon seclusion, dispassion, and cessation, maturing in release.<sup>29</sup>

Here, it indicates that if one practises the Four Immeasurables accompanied by the Enlightenment factors, one can attain *nibbāna*.

The practices of the Four Immeasurables are the same among the different traditions. It is also common that one can attain the *jhānas* based on lovingkindness leading to rebirth in the brahmā world. If one takes this as a basis for developing insight, then one can attain arahantship.

The Sarvāstivādins clearly state that the *Samādhi* of the Four Immeasurables can lead one to *nibbāna/nirvāṇa*. This connection can be found in some Pāli suttas in SN42, where “the *Samādhi* of the Four Immeasurables” is used, rather than the Four Immeasurables.

---

<sup>28</sup> SN42.9, translated by Bhikkhu Bodhi. *The Connected Discourses of the Buddha: a new translation of the Saṃyutta Nikāya* (Somerville: Wisdom Publications, 2000). e-book (epub). It is sense-sphere *kamma* that is called limited *kamma*.

<sup>29</sup> See Bhikkhu Bodhi SN46:54, footnote 109: This conjunction of the enlightenment factors with the four divine abodes is unusual. On their own momentum the divine abodes lead to rebirth in the brahmā world rather than to Nibbāna (see MN II 82,24-27, II 207-8, AN II 128-29). When integrated into the structure of the Buddha’s path, however, they can be used to generate concentration of sufficient strength to serve as a basis for insight, which in turn brings enlightenment. A striking instance is at MN I 351,18-352,2. Spk (Sāratthappakāsinī, Saṃyutta Nikāya-aṭṭhakathā): The monk develops the three *jhānas* based on lovingkindness, then takes this as a basis for developing insight and attains arahantship. The enlightenment factors are developed by insight and the path. SA:743 《雜阿含經》卷27: 「心與慈俱多修習, 於淨最勝」(T99, p. 197, c11). Also, the Abhidharma-vibhāsā-śāstra quoted from Āgama: 《阿毘達磨大毘婆沙論》卷83: 「如契經說。與慈俱修念等覺支。依止離。依止無欲。依止滅。」(T1545, p. 427, c19-20)

The Mahāyāna teaching can be seen to stress on lovingkindness and compassion. Practicing lovingkindness and compassion without a sense of self is the core of Mahāyāna Buddhism.

## Abbreviation and Bibliography

AN ...Aṅguttara Nikāya.

CBETA Chinese Buddhist Electronic Text Association (中華電子佛典協會)

DN ...Dīgha Nikāya.

MN...Majjhima Nikāya.

SN ....Saṃyutta Nikāya. For example, “SN11.3” means “the 11<sup>th</sup> Saṃyutta in the Saṃyutta-nikāya, the 3<sup>rd</sup> sutta. Sutta numbers refers to Bhikkhu Bodhi's translation. *The Connected Discourses of the Buddha: a new translation of the Saṃyutta Nikāya*. Somerville: Wisdom Publications, 2000.

T..... *Taishō shinshū daizōkyō* 大正新脩大藏經 (CBETA edition). Edited by Takakusu Junjirō 高楠順次朗 and Watanabe Kaigyoku 渡邊海旭 (Tokyo: Taishō issaikyō kankōkai, 1924–1932). Cited by text number (T) followed by page, column and line number(s). For example, “T1509.1a24” means Taishō text number 1509, page1, column a, line 24.

### Chinese Texts

*Ānāpāna Mindfulness Sūtra*. T602 安般守意經 *An-pan shou yi jing*.

*Biography of Eminent Monk Fa Xian*. T2085 高僧法顯傳 *Gao seng fa xian chuan*.

*Dharmatrāta-dhyāna-sūtra*. T618 達摩多羅禪經 *Da mo duo luo chan*.

*Dhyānasamādhi-sūtra*. T514 坐禪三昧經 *Zuo chan san mei jing*.

*Mahāprajñāpāramitopadeśa*. T1509 大智度論 *Da zhi du lun*.

*Outlining the Way to Reflect*. T617 思惟要略法 *Si wei lü yao fa*.

*Pañcadvāradhyānasūtramahārthadharmā*. T619 五門禪經要用法 *Wu men chan jing yao yong fa*.

*Records of the Canon*. T2145 出三藏記集 *Chu san zang ji ji*.

Lu Cheng. *Outline of Chinese Buddhism* 中国佛学源流略讲. Beijing: Zhonghua Book company, 1979.

Yinshun. *Study on Sarvāstivādin Abhidharma and Ābhidarmikas*. Taiwan: Zhengwen Publisher, 1992. 說一切有部為主的論書與論師之研究 (正聞出版社 中華民國八十一年)

### English Texts

Anālayo. *Satipaṭṭhāna: the Direct Path to Realization*. Birmingham: Windhorse Publications, 2003.

Bhikkhu Bodhi. trans. *The numerical discourses of the Buddha: a translation of the Aṅguttara Nikāya*. Somerville: Wisdom Publications, 2012.

----. trans. *The Connected Discourses of the Buddha: a new translation of the Saṃyutta Nikāya*. Somerville: Wisdom Publications, 2000.

Bhikkhu Ñāṇamoli and Bhikkhu Bodhi. trans. *The middle length discourses of the Buddha: a new translation of the Majjhima Nikāya*. Somerville: Wisdom Publications, 1995.

- Chan, Yiu-wing. *An English Translation of the Dharmatrāra-Dhyāna-Sūtra—With Annotation and a Critical Introduction*. Dissertation. Hong Kong: The University of Hong Kong, 2009.
- Chen, Jinhua. “Meditation Traditions in Fifth-century Northern China: with a Special Note on a Forgotten “kaśmīri” Meditation Tradition Brought to China by Buddhahdra (359-429).” In Tansen Sen edit. *Buddhism Across Asia Networks of Material, Intellectual and Cultural Exchange*. Volume 1. Singapore: Institute of Southeast Asian Studies, 2014: 101-130.
- Demiéville, Paul. “La Yogācārabhūmi de Sangharaksa.” In: *Bulletin de l'Ecole française d'Extrême-Orient*. Tome 44 N°2, 1951. pp. 339-436.
- Greene, Eric M. “Healing breaths and rotting bones: On the relationship between Buddhist and Chinese meditation Practices during the eastern Han And three kingdoms period.” *Journal of Chinese Religions*, 42. 2, 145–184, November 2014.
- . *Meditation, Repentance, and Visionary Experience in Early Medieval Chinese Buddhism*. PhD dissertation. University of California, Berkeley, 2012.
- Gunaratana, Henepola. *A Critical Analysis of the Jhanas in Theravada Buddhist Meditation*. Dissertation. The American University, 1980.
- KL., Dhammajoti “*The aśubha Meditation in the Sarvāstivāda.*” *Journal of Buddhist Studies* ( 2009, Colombo), vol. VII. 248-295.
- Nyanaponika Thera. *The Heart of Buddhist Meditation: A handbook of mental training based on the Buddha's way*. Kandy: Buddhist Publication Society, 2005.
- Suen, Stephen. *Methods of spiritual praxis in the Sarvāstivāda: A Study Primarily Based on the Abhidharma-mahāvibhāṣā*. Dissertation. Hong Kong: The University of Hong Kong, 2013.
- Willemen, Charles. *Outlining the Way to Reflect*. Mumbai: Somaiya Publications, 2012.
- Yamabe, Nobuyoshi and Fumihiko Sueki, trans. *The Sūtra on the Concentration of Sitting Meditation*. Berkeley: Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research, 2009.